



**ASSESSMENT THE QUALITY OF PUBLIC SERVICES IN EXECUTIVE
ORGANIZATIONS OF IRANSHAHR CITY BY USING GARVIN MODEL AND
PRIORITIZE THEM**

**^{1*}MASOUD POURKIANI, ²SEYYED GHOLAM REZA, HOSSEINI POOR GHASEM
ABADI**

¹Department of Humanities, Islamic Azad University, Kerman Branch, Kerman, Iran

²Department of Humanities, Islamic Azad University, Iranshahr Branch, Iranshahr, Iran

ABSTRACT

This research tries to recognize expectations and perceptions of customers from public services of executive organizations in Iransshahr city regarding to definition of quality equivalent with to meet customers demands. The main aim of this research is determining the quality gaps of these services by using Garvin's assessment model in studied organizations. Data of this applied and descriptive research were gathered from selected sample that includes 384 subjects from all people who referred to executive organizations in Iranshahr city. They were selected based on cluster sampling method according to size of studied population. Data gathering tools include questionnaire contains 24 dual questions related to eight aspects of quality: notification, speed, accuracy, aesthetics, proper behavior, law-abiding, simplicity and flexibility. The results show that there is significant difference between expectations and perceptions of customers in all eight aspects of quality. This difference is highest in aspect of notification and least in accuracy aspects, respectively. In terms of priority, notification aspect occupied the first priority and flexibility in eight priority, respectively. Thus, it is suggested that customer's expectation from quality of services should be considered in addition to using new communicative techniques and office equipment, staff training, more accurate control and reporting, high attention to aesthetics, cleanness and harmony of all elements and organizational environment.

Keywords: Notification, Accuracy, Aesthetics, Proper behavior, law-abiding, flexibility.

INTRODUCTION

Today, globalization has affected on administrative evolutions due to improvements of technology, speed of communications and changes of values, cultures and political expectations and perceptions of nations.

Changes of citizens' expectations and perceptions caused to these evolutions changed from internal matters in to external matters.

Indeed, responsibility of public organization towards citizens has caused governments see people from new sight as customers of private sectors and try to meet highest level of their satisfaction (Khaki, 2002 : 26).

In past, main attention of public management focused on internal events of organization mainly internal problems of organizations (Alvani & Danieefard, 2000 : 295). Today, public management should recognize its social and public aspects and be aware from its effects on social environment and also, it should consider the problems of citizens as its main issue (Alvani, 1991 : 21).

In the present age, the approach of public organizations towards matters such as effectiveness and efficiency has changed politically and fundamentally.

In spite of traditional approaches, new approaches consider different aspects which

mainly they are non-financial. Administrative health and satisfaction of public organizations is considered as one of main indicators of evolution of administrative system and improvement of public organization performance in all administrative systems of different countries (Sharifi keloe, 1999 : 21).

By attention to nature of public organizations in Iran and importance of attention to definition of quality and standard in customers' view towards organizations that provide public services this question is developed that: how different components and aspects of quality are important in public organizations of Iran? And how attention level of organizations to these aspects is close to attention level of customers? If attention level of organization be more closer to attention level of customers, dissatisfaction of customers will decrease and their satisfaction and success of organizations will increase.

Regarding to this important point that the population of this city was 215981 people according to census in 2006 and they need services such as public services and welfare and since the organizations and public agencies of this city have not enough facilities and regional power to provide

satisfactory public services to clients, it is necessary to study these problems in such researches. Thus, this research tries to study the quality of public services in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city.

LITERATURE REVIEW:

Conducted researches and studies in this case can be considered as guide light for recent and future researches.

Mohammadi et al (2003) in a study entitled “Measurement the quality of services based on patients’ expectations and perceptions of Zanjan hospitals” found that: the ability of doctors and hospital staff in creating confidence and trust among clients and having enough professional competence were most important factors of quality of provided services. Also, there was significant difference between the mean of expectations and perceptions in all aspects, statistically. Thus, the most acute problems facing hospitals are ability of doctors and hospital staff to build confidence and trust among patients and their enough professional skills. Rezaee Golabad (2007) in his study entitled “Study of the service quality gap in Iran insurance company by using Servqual model” achieved these results that: the quality of provided services by Iran insurance company could not meet its

policyholders’ expectations. The lowest rate of gap between policyholders’ expectations and perceptions was related to tangible factors and the highest gap was related to two empathy and responsibility components. Also, the obtained results of Friedman test to determine the importance of these components show that empathy is most important component in view of policyholders and tangible factors have lowest importance. Hossaini (2010) in his study entited “ study and measurement the quality of services and its relation to customers’ expectations: A Case Study Tejarat Bank” found that: there is significant relationship between confidence to Tejarat Bank and customers’ satisfaction. There is significant relationship between tangible factors of Tejarat Bank and customers’ satisfaction. There is significant relationship between responsibility of Tejarat Bank and customers’ satisfaction. There is significant relationship between empathy of Tejarat Bank and customers’ satisfaction. Nike et al (2010) in a study entitled “ quality of services and its effect on customer’ s satisfaction in retail sales” achieved following results: five aspects of service quality include: aesthetics, reliability, responsibility, empathy and warranty for this empirical research have been studied.

Provided services by retail sellers had positive effect and customer 's satisfaction was significant. The findings of this research show that aspects of service quality to attract customer 's satisfaction in retail store that is a young sector with potential growing and numerous opportunities in economy systems like India, is crucial. Marok et al (2010) in a study entitled " perceptions of service quality among cooperative and Islamic banks in Britain" achieved following results: the results of comparative study of averages in six aspects(desirability, assurance, reliability, aesthetics, empathy and responsibility) showed that issues related to desirability were most important factors for customers of cooperative banks, while empathy and responsibility aspects were most important factors for customers of Islamic banks. On the other words, the highest ranking among these two banks obtained since customers of Islamic banks did not paid and take interest in saving and loan , they selected these factors as preferred matter and customers of cooperative banks selected moral values as the highest rank. Also, results showed that issues related to ensuring achieved same rank in both banks.

RESEARCH HYPOTHESES:**MAIN HYPOTHESIS:**

There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city in case of service quality.

Secondary hypotheses:

First hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to notification component.

Second hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to performance speed component.

Third hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to performance accuracy component.

Forth hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to aesthetics component.

Fifth hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to proper and desirable behavior component.

Sixth hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to law-abiding component.

Seventh hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to simplicity component.

Eighth hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to flexibility component.

Ninth hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to gender component.

Tenth hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to marital status component.

Eleventh hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to education level component.

Twelfth hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers' expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city regard to work experience component.

Methodology:

This research used descriptive and analytic method. Statistical community of this research includes all clients of administrative and public organizations of Iranshahr city and they are unlimited and the number of administrative organizations are 38 organizations. Sample community includes 384 clients in administrative and public agencies of Iranshahr city who referred to different sectors of executive organizations of Iranshahr city. The size of sample obtained by using following formula:

$$N = \frac{z^2}{4d^2} = \frac{1.96}{4 \times (0.5)^2}$$

Questionnaires were distributed among 38 executive organizations of Iranshahr city by using random cluster sampling method. So, 10 questionnaires were distributed in each of these organizations and 14 questionnaires were distributed in governor's office because of its importance. Data collection tools include a developed questionnaire by researcher composed of 24 questions. So, for every component of Garvin's aspects were designed three questions. After collecting

answers, to determine the validity of questionnaire was used content validity and sigma count method. Finally, validity was calculated 0.78 and was approved. To determine the reliability was used “re-test” method. Thus, questionnaires were distributed during two steps by interval ten days between 8 members of the statistical population, experimentally (it should be noted that these 8 people were selected randomly). Reliability of questionnaire was calculated 0.79 by using Spearman correlation coefficient and was approved.

Findings:

A: Main hypothesis: There is significant difference between the average of customers’

expectations and perceptions in administrative organizations of Iranshahr city in case of service quality.

Customers’ expectations and their perceptions were compared in case of public service quality by using Wilcoxon test and P-value was equal to 0.000 that is less than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers’ expectations and their perceptions in case of public service quality. The results of this research are constant with results of mentioned researches in literature review.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions-expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			Quality of public services
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.982	192.5	384	(1) Negative ranks	24.094	99.97	384	14.92	158.53	384	
		0	0	(2) Positive ranks							
			0	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

B: First secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers’ expectations and their perceptions regard to notification component.

Customers’ expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to notification component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal to 0.000 that is

less than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers’ expectations and their perceptions regard to notification component.

Significa	Z	Mean of	numbe	Perceptions-	Customers' perceptions	Customers' expectations
-----------	---	---------	-------	--------------	------------------------	-------------------------

				expectations	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Notification
0.000	-16.885	190.50	378(α)	(1) Negative ranks	3.40	11.69	384	1.69	20.04	384	
		2	1	(2) Positive ranks							
			5	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

C: Second secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to speed of provided servies.

Customers' expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to speed of provided services component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal to

0.000 that is less than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to speed of provided services component.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions-expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			Speed of provided services
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.786	188.96	373	(1) Negative ranks	3.90	12.42	384	1.99	19.93	384	
		9.50	2	(2) Positive ranks							
			9	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

D: Third secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to accuracy of public services component.

Customers' expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to accuracy of public services component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal

to 0.000 that is less than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to accuracy of public services component.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions-expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			Accuracy of
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.713	187.92	369	(1) Negative ranks	3.77	13.28	384	2.21	19.77	384	

	12.00	3	(2) Positive ranks							
		12	(3) Equal							
		384	Total							

E: Forth secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to aesthetics component.

Customers' expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to aesthetics component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal to 0.000 that is

less than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to aesthetics component.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions-expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			Aesthetics
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.885	190.00	379(α)	(1) Negative ranks	3.42	12.26	384	2.09	19.91	384	
		0	0	(2) Positive ranks							
			5	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

F: Fifth secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to proper behavior component.

Customers' expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to proper behavior component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal to 0.000 that is less

than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to proper behavior component.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions-expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			Proper behavior
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.506	186.29	363	(1) Negative ranks	4.02	13.05	384	2.32	19.81	384	
		54.60	5	(2) Positive ranks							
			16	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

G: Sixth secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to law-abiding component.

Customers' expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to law-abiding component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal to 0.000 that is less

than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to law-abiding component.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions-expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.783	188.95	373	(1) Negative ranks	4.05	12.57	384	2.18	19.88	384	Law-abiding
		11.50	2	(2) Positive ranks							
			9	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

H: Seventh secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to simplicity component.

Customers' expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to simplicity component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal to 0.000 that is

less than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to simplicity component.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions-expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.883	190.00	379	(1) Negative ranks	3.99	12.21	384	2.52	19.68	384	Simplicity
		0	0	(2) Positive ranks							
			5	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

I: Eighth secondary hypothesis: there is significant difference between customers'

expectations and their perceptions regard to flexibility component.

Customers' expectations and their perceptions were compared regard to flexibility component by using Wilcoxon test and P- value was equal to 0.000 that is less than significant level $\alpha = 0.05$. Thus, H_0 hypothesis assumed that there is no

significant difference is rejected. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions regard to flexibility component.

Significant level	Z statistic	Mean of ranks	number	Perceptions- expectations	Customers' perceptions			Customers' expectations			Flexibility
					Standard deviation	Mean	Number	Standard deviation	Mean	Number	
0.000	-16.856	192.39	374	(1) Negative ranks	3.85	12.48	384	2.59	19.51	384	
		11.50	5	(2) Positive ranks							
			5	(3) Equal							
			384	Total							

INTERMEDIATE VARIABLES:

A: Comparison the customers 's expectations and perceptions in men and women groups: Customers' expectations and perceptions in men and women groups were compared by using Mann-Whitney U- test and since P- value (significant level) of expectation variable in men and women groups are equal to 0.768 and it is more than significant level ($\alpha = 0.05$). Thus, H_0 hypothesis is not rejected in this level. As a result, it can be

said that there is no significant difference between customers' expectation scores in men and women groups and since P-value (significant level) the variable of customers 's perceptions in men and women groups is equal to 0.001 and it is less than significant level ($\alpha = 0.05$). Thus, H_0 is rejected in this level. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' perceptions in men and women groups.

Significant level	Z statistic	Wilcoxon W	Mann-Whitney U	Woman		man		Variable Gender
				Mean of ranks	Number	Mean of ranks	Number	
0.768	-2.96	16546.500	12451.500	183.85	90	187.35	282	Customers' expectations
0.001	-3.372	49598.500	9695.500	219.77	90	175.88	282	Customers' perceptions

B: Comparison customers' expectations and perceptions in single and married groups: Customers' expectations and perceptions in single and married groups were compared

by using Mann-Whitney U- test and since P- value (significant level) of expectation variable in single and married groups are equal to 0.215 , 0.320 respectively and since

they are more than significant level ($\alpha = 0.05$). Thus, H_0^1 , H_0^2 hypotheses are not rejected in this level. As a result, it can be

said that there is no significant difference between customers' expectation scores in single and married groups.

Significant level	Z statistic	Wilcoxon W	Mann-Whitney U	Woman		man		Variable Gender
				Mean of ranks	Number	Mean of ranks	Number	
0.215	-1.241	47579.00	10723.000	175.57	271	189.81	86	Customers' expectations
0.320	-.994	47680.00	10824.000	175.94	271	188.64	86	Customers' perceptions

C: Comparison customers' expectations and perceptions in different ranks of education levels:

Customers' expectations and perceptions in different ranks of education levels were compared by using Mann-Whitney U- test and since P-value (significant level) of expectation variable in single and married

groups are equal to 0.000 , 0.002 respectively and since they are less than significant level ($\alpha = 0.05$). Thus, H_0^1 , H_0^2 hypotheses are rejected in this level. As a result, it can be said that there is no significant difference between customers' expectation scores in different ranks of education levels.

Customers' perceptions		Customers' expectations		Variables Education level
Mean of ranks	Number	Mean of ranks	Number	-
151.85	104	213.41	104	Below diploma
191.41	118	192.98	118	Diploma
206.83	86	144.05	86	Associate' s degree
189.58	58	169.07	58	Bachelor of science and above

	366	366	Total
-	14.346	26.802	K ²
	3	3	Freedom degree
	0.002	0.000	Significant level

D: Comparison customers' expectations and perceptions in different ranks of work experience:

Customers' expectations and perceptions in different ranks of work experience were compared by using Kruskal Wallis- test and

since P-value (significant level) of above variables in different ranks of work experience are equal to 0.000 , 0.058 respectively and since they are less than significant level ($\alpha = 0.05$). Thus, H_0^1 hypothesis is rejected in this level. As a

result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' expectation scores in different ranks of work experience. Comparison the mean of ranks show that expectations of employed persons in private sectors are more that employed persons in public sectors and since significant level of

their expectations more than significant level ($\alpha = 0.05$). Thus H_0^2 is not rejected in this level. As a result, it can be said that there is significant difference between customers' perceptions in different ranks of work experience.

	Customers' perceptions		Customers' expectations		Variables Work experience
	Mean of ranks	Number	Mean of ranks	Number	-
	158.13	46	142.78	46	<5
	183.18	37	90.32	37	5-15
	133.92	25	77.68	25	16-25
	144.56	17	88.85	17	=>26
	140.02	170	178.22	170	Non - state job
		295		295	
	9.141		82.692		K^2
	4		4		Freedom degree
	0.058		0.000		Significant degree

CONCLUSION:

The results of this research showed that there is quality gap in all eight aspects of service quality in public service sectors of administrative organizations in Iranshahr city. It shows that there is significant difference between customers' expectations and their perceptions of service quality in administrative organizations in Iranshahr city. This difference shows highest value in notification aspect and lowest value in accuracy aspect, respectively. Thus, notification and flexibility aspects occupy first and eight priorities, respectively. Finally. It is suggested that customer's expectation of service quality should be considered in addition to using new and

modern communicative techniques, office automation, staff training and retraining in timely manner, reporting and more accurate control, also high attention to aesthetics, cleanness and harmony of all elements and environment of organization.

REFERENCES:

1. M. Alvani (1991), Management of Public Affairs, Journal of Management Studies, Issue 6, PP. 21-35
2. M. Alvani, H. Danaeefard (2000), Discussions About the philosophy of government agencies and organizations theory. First printing, Saffar publications, Tehran.

3. G. Khaki, ((2002). "Virtualization government strategy: The most important challenge for the administrative system in the Fourth Development Plan", Journal of management and development, No. 58, pp. 36-23.
4. G. Khaki and H. Farhad Nejad (2007). "Comparative study of the affecting factors on performance of government institutions in the provinces of (a) and (b) provide a model for improving their performance (with an emphasis on honoring and client satisfaction "Quarterly Journal of Economics Management, No. 75, pp. 109-91.
5. G. Khaki, (1998). "Research Methodology at the end of a programming approach", first printing, scientific research center publications.
6. M. Rjabbaigy, (1997). "the quality of the public sector", Journal of Public Administration, No. 40, pp. 84-77.
7. F. Rahnavard, (2003). "Empowerment of staff , a step toward attracting the customer' s satisfaction", Journal of Process Management and Development, No. 59, pp. 37-28.
8. B.Riahi,(2002),total quality management in the public sector, first printing, Training Industrial Research center of Iran, Tehran.
9. M.Sharifi Koloee, (1999)."A model to recognize the pathology organizations", Journal of Management and Development, No. 5, pp. 19-8.
10. A. Kazemi, (1999), political management and government policy,first printing, Islamic Farhang publications, Tehran.
11. Fecikova, I.(2004). An Index Method for Measurement of Customer Satisfaction, The TQM Magazine, Volume 16, Number 1.
12. 2) Jensen, poulBuch (2001). Customer Satisfaction Analysis , U.S.A.[on line]. [6May 2004].